

## PROCEEDINGS OF THE HISTORIC CONSERVATION BOARD

APRIL 10, 2000

The Historic Conservation Board met at 3:00 P.M., in the J. Martin Griesel Room, Centennial Plaza II, with Messrs. Bloomfield, Kreider, Raser, Senhauser and Mmes. Borys, Spraul-Schmidt and Wallace present. Mr. Dale and Ms. Sullebarger were absent.

### **MINUTES**

The minutes of the March 27, 2000 meeting were approved as amended (motion by Raser, second by Kreider).

### **CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS, 331 TUSCULUM AVENUE, COLUMBIA-TUSCULUM HISTORIC DISTRICT**

Staff member Dan Young summarized the staff report.

### **BOARD ACTION**

After discussing the issues, the Board voted unanimously (motion by Spraul-Schmidt, second by Raser) to approve the Certificate of Appropriateness for expansion of the existing side porch and the construction of replacement rear steps for the building at 331 Tusculum Avenue in the Columbia Tusculum Historic District, as shown in the plans submitted with application 2000P02588.

### **CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS, 123 EAST LIBERTY STREET, OVER-THE-RHINE HISTORIC DISTRICT**

Staff member Caroline Kellam distributed photographs and summarized the staff report on the proposed rehabilitation of the building at this address as an arts center with offices. Rehabilitation will include constructing a new front entrance, lobby and stairwell on the north (Liberty Street) elevation and replacing wood sash windows on the west elevation.

Jim Cheng, AIA, of KZF Incorporated, Architects and consultant Robert Powell were present to answer questions.

Mr. Raser asked about existing windows on the north elevation. Ms. Kellam said that this wall had few openings since it originally faced into the side of an adjacent building since removed. The present openings are not original and will be in-filled. In response to Mr. Raser, Mr. Cheng said that the modified openings in the south and west walls will be restored.

Ms. Wallace asked about signage for the building. Ms. Kellam responded that signage is not included in this application and must be reviewed at a later date. Mr. Powell said that signage will probably be cut out metal letters attached to the brick wall.

### **BOARD ACTION**

The Board voted unanimously (motion by Borys, second by Spraul-Schmidt) to:

1. Approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for the rehabilitation of 123 E. Liberty Street including the proposal for wood replacement windows on the west elevation to match the steel windows on the south elevation.
2. Approve the design for the addition of an enclosed stairwell and lobby entrance along the north elevation, including new landscaping, a fence for the outdoor area and improvements to the parking lot.
3. Require a separate permit for review of any new signs.

**CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS AND ZONING VARIANCE, 5 1/2 BEECHCREST LANE, EAST WALNUT HILLS HISTORIC DISTRICT**

Staff member Caroline Kellam distributed maps, drawings and photographs and summarized the application to repair existing retaining walls, construct a formal garden and build a stone garden house designed to be compatible with the residence. Zoning permits such construction in the rear yard, but because the residence sits so deep on the lot, the property essentially has no rear yard. As a result, a variance is needed to construct an accessory building in a side rather than a rear yard.

Mr. Glen Lindahl with Abbots Wood, Ltd. was present, representing Ms. Ann Davis Gutman, the property owner.

Mr. Kreider asked whether there was a setback problem since the garden building will be in the side rather than the rear yard. Ms. Kellam said the garden building will be nine feet or more from the property line and the building height meets requirements for an accessory building. Mr. Senhauser asked about the windows and door in the garden building. Mr. Lindahl replied the windows are old leaded-glass ones the owner has purchased to be installed in the building; likewise, the door is a reclaimed wooden one with a leaded glass light.

**BOARD ACTION**

The Board voted unanimously (motion by Bloomfield, second by Raser) to:

1. Approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for the construction of a formal garden and a stone garden building on the property.
2. Approve a variance to allow the construction of an accessory building in the side yard of 5 1/2 Beechcrest Lane as per Section 1469-121(a), finding that such relief from the literal implication of the Zoning Code:
  - a) Is necessary and appropriate in the interest of historic conservation so as not to adversely affect the historic architectural or aesthetic integrity of the district; and
  - b) Will not be materially detrimental to the public health, safety, and welfare or injurious to the property in the district or vicinity where the property is located.

**CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS & ZONING VARIANCE, 2731-2733 CLEINVIEW AVENUE, CLEINVIEW/HACKBERRY HISTORIC DISTRICT**

Urban Conservator William Forwood summarized the staff report and reminded the Board that it had previously approved a Certificate of Appropriateness and zoning variances for this project. The current application is for approval to extend the approved porches an additional three feet toward the street. This requires a zoning variance to allow a 20-foot front yard setback (rather than the required 25-foot front

yard setback). The applicant has agreed to this change in order to settle a law suit brought by a neighbor disputing the Board's initial approvals.

Mr. Kreider asked if there is a written agreement between the owners and other interested parties. Tim Burke, Esq., attorney for the other interested parties, indicated that his clients supported the new application and submitted a letter of concurrence signed by six neighbors agreeing to this compromise.

#### **BOARD ACTION**

The Board voted unanimously (motion by Bloomfield, second by Raser) to:

1. Approve a Certificate of Appropriateness to allow the front porches to be six rather than three feet in depth, recognizing that the new dimension is equally acceptable to that previously approved.
2. Approve a Zoning Variance to allow the front yard setback to be reduced to twenty feet on both 2731 and 2733 Cleinview, finding that is in the interest of historic conservation to resolve the dispute between Ms. Evans, the applicants and the City, and that granting the variance
  - Is necessary and appropriate in the interest of historic conservation so as not to adversely affect the historic, architectural, or aesthetic integrity of the district; and
  - Will not be materially detrimental to the public health, safety and welfare or injurious to property in the district or vicinity where the property is located.

#### **BY LEAVE**

Ms. Kellam reminded the Board that at its March 27, 2000, meeting the Board tabled an application by Christian Hills Academy (owner of the WLWT Building at 140 West Ninth Street) for a Certificate of Appropriateness for window replacement. The applicant had proposed a Marvin aluminum-clad wood window to replace the original metal casements. The Board requested that the owners contact manufacturers of appropriate metal replacement windows and present a sample of the replacement windows to the Board for review. Mr. Kreider acknowledged his association with the owner and recused himself.

Mr. Jerry Adkins, representing the Christian Hills Academy Board, and Mr. Ray Conn, representing ArCon, the contractor on the job, showed a sample sash and distributed detailed drawings of the proposed windows including mullion and jamb sections. Mr. Conn said the replacement window proposed for both the casements on the street facades and the sash windows on the minor facades will be custom made by Marvin to fit the existing openings and to replicate the existing windows as closely as possible.

Mr. Senhauser stated that one issue raised by the Board at the last meeting is that the original steel casement windows had a much flatter cross section than the proposed aluminum-clad replacements. Mr. Conn said the only difference will be the use of a standard 1 1/8 inch mullion to replace the existing, flatter 1 1/2 inch mullion on the metal casements and that the exterior frame will be 2 1/2 inches rather than the original 1 1/2". He indicated that the new glass will be on the same plane as that of the original windows.

In answer to Mr. Senhauser, Mr. Conn said the original metal windows required replacement because the mullions had rusted through; the tubular steel frames on the second floor windows will remain. Mr. Raser asked whether steel replacement windows had been considered. Mr. Conn said they had been considered but that the cost of modern steel or aluminum windows will be more than double the cost of the Marvin windows and still will not duplicate the originals.

Mr. Raser asked whether Mr. Conn could have a sample of the Marvin window installed in one of the window openings. Mr. Raser suggested that the Board could best understand the proposed replacements by seeing a typical unit in place. He wants to see how the window sits in that space and how the frame differs from what is there now; he would like to be able to step back 20 feet and look at it. Mr. Conn said no single sample of the proposed windows is available but that he could arrange to have Marvin provide several different samples, one showing the proper mullion, another with the proper trim piece or border, etc.

Ms. Borys noted that the different versions of the elevation drawings of the first floor openings show significantly different dimensions for the openings and was concerned that the configuration of the original windows be accurately reproduced.

Mr. Adkins said that the school acquired the building because of its historic significance and location; it has been remodeled at least five times in the past and had both asbestos and lead problems. He apologized for the premature window removal. He said the school has operated in good faith in its efforts to renovate the building so that it is architecturally consistent with what was there in the past, using currently available materials, and have it ready for the school year beginning in August 2000.

Mr. Senhauser stated that the Historic Conservation Board's involvement with this project began in December and that the issues of demolition and the replacement windows are not yet totally resolved. Ms. Spraul-Schmidt commented that it appears that more windows have been removed from the building since the March 27 HCB meeting. Ms. Kellam confirmed that no permits for exterior work have been issued and that all windows were in place when the interior work permits were issued in January. Mr. Conn said he is not aware that more windows have been removed since that meeting and that he had instructed the demolition contractor to cease any further removals.

Ms. Borys said that she is concerned that the windows not only look right but hold up for the long term. She wondered whether installing wood windows against the existing steel tube will cause maintenance problems. Mr. Conn said that the wood windows should suffer fewer expansion and contraction problems than metal replacements.

Mr. Senhauser asked whether all the windows will be fixed, or if some will be operable sash or casement windows. Mr. Adkins said the street-side windows will be fixed; those on the minor facades will be operable sash units, although he would prefer that all be fixed. The Board agreed that the windows need not be operable, but stressed that the appearance of the replacements be that of the originals.

Mr. Senhauser asked about the color for the proposed windows. Mr. Conn showed the samples of standard Marvin colors and indicated white would be used. Mr. Senhauser suggested that the warmer "Stone" white be used instead of "Artic" which has a pronounced blue cast. Likewise, the low-e glass can have a violet reflection.

Mr. Bloomfield said there are still two issues unresolved in his mind: 1) the placement of the glass in the wall plane and 2) the profile of the mullions and frame members. Ely Ryder, Esq., Counsel to the Board, suggested that the determination of the appropriateness of the windows be delegated to the Urban Conservator in consultation with the Board members who are concerned about this issue. This will allow the decision to go forward as soon as the sample can be brought to the site.

Mr. Conn said the present doors are not the originals and would be replaced with new aluminum clad wood doors with thermopane panels.

Ms. Kellam said any request for signage for the school will be a separate proposal.

Mr. Jay Wood, representing the adjoining property owner at 124 West Ninth Street, spoke against the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness. He expressed concern that architectural significance features had been removed and discarded during this renovation, including Palladian window details from the Ninth Street elevation. He said no further removal of any other features should be permitted until an overall plan for restoration has been developed.

#### **BOARD ACTION**

The Board voted unanimously (motion Raser, second by Borys) to approve a Certificate of Appropriateness for the installation of new replacement windows and doors at 140 West Ninth Street on the condition that:

1. The features of the replacement windows, including the color, detailing, placement, size and shape, match the original features
2. Samples of the two primary window types be placed for review and acceptance by the Urban Conservator and interested members of the Board
3. Any final details or changes to the proposal be additionally reviewed by the Urban Conservator.

#### **ADJOURNMENT**

As there were no other items for consideration by the Board, the meeting adjourned (motion by Spraul-Schmidt, second by Raser).

---

William L. Forwood  
Urban Conservator

---

John C. Senhauser  
Chairman

---

Date